PRACTICING WHAT YOU PREACH

Accountability as a critical enabler to reducing gender-based violence and violence against children in a community mobilization trial in rural South Africa

SVRI 2019

Sarah Treves-Kagan, Suzanne Maman, Nomhle Khoza, Catherine MacPhail, Dean Peacock, Rhian Twine, Kathleen Kahn, Sheri A. Lippman & Audrey Pettifor

Contact information: kagan.sarah@gmail.com
BACKGROUND
VIOLENCE IN SOUTH AFRICA

Extremely high rates of intimate partner violence, non-partner sexual violence, violence against children and assault

Gender-transformative programming as primary prevention

(Dunkle et al. 2004; Madu & Peltzer 2001; Seedat et al 2009)
PREVENTION APPROACHES: ADDRESS STRUCTURAL DETERMINANTS
ONE MAN CAN

- Gender, Power and Health
- Gender and violence
- Gender & HIV/AIDS
- Alcohol
- Healthy relationships
- Human rights
- Taking action
COMMUNITY MOBILIZATION

- Inherently a community process
- “Activities that target and aim to empower individual community members should be distinguished from community mobilization efforts which seek to construct a collective entity out of a group of individuals.” Evans et al. 2010

A defined or shared concern/problem
Community sensitization or critical consciousness
Organizational structure with links to networks
Leadership
Collective or shared activities/actions
Social Cohesion

Slide adapted from S Lippman and A Pettifor; Evans et al. 2010; Lippman et al 2013
CLUSTER RANDOMIZED CONTROL TRIAL

- **Design**: Village level randomization (N = 22): 11 villages received CM and 11 control villages
- **Goal**: Promote gender equitable behavior through community mobilization
- **Target Group**: Men 18-35
- **Content**: Gender transformative programming developed in collaboration with Sonke Gender Justice
- **Activities**: Workshops, leadership meetings, activities
- **Timeline**: 2 year intervention (May 2012-June 2014)
RCT FOUND SOME PUZZLING RESULTS

• 33% of men in intervention villages participated in at least one two-day workshop; and 2/3 had high exposure to OMC

• Improvement’s in men’s gender equitable norms, but not women’s

• Non-significant decrease in IPV victimization in the last 12 months but no change in men’s perpetration
RESEARCH OBJECTIVE

• Qualitatively explore individual and community-level facilitators and barriers to individual-level changes in use of violence using longitudinal qualitative data
METHODS
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2012</th>
<th>2013</th>
<th>2014</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Intervention</strong></td>
<td>✗</td>
<td>✗</td>
<td>✗</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mobilizers (n=13)</td>
<td></td>
<td>✗</td>
<td>✗</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CATs (n=11)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✗</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community (n=14)</td>
<td></td>
<td>✗</td>
<td>✗</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>Description</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MOBILIZERS (n=13)</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>OMC employees hired to conduct workshops, community activities, leadership and community engagement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CATS (n=11)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Volunteer groups supporting the mobilizer’s activities. Groups ranged in size from 3-9 CAT members. CATs were mixed gender but generally more women than men.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COMMUNITY MEMBERS (n=14)</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>Community members who had participated in OMC workshops were recommended for participation by mobilizers</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
In-depth interviews and focus groups
Audio recorded, simultaneously translated and transcribed
Coded
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ID</th>
<th>Type</th>
<th>M/F</th>
<th>Time 1</th>
<th>Time 2</th>
<th>Thoughts about Change</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>XX</td>
<td>MOB</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>She describes why violence stays hidden; no violence in her house; improved her communication; used to hit child;</td>
<td>GBV rare in her community; has a hard time stopping hitting her child--expresses guilt but also a bit defensive (child did something wrong/only do it inside the house)</td>
<td>Struggling with disciplining her child without yelling or violence</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Theme: Accountability

Group: Community Mobilizers

Interpretation

Illustrative Quotes

Code Co-occurrence by Gender/Time

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>People</th>
<th>Accountability % of People</th>
<th>Accountability % of Quotes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Men, Year 1 (n=5)</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Men, Year 2 (n=5)</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women, Year 2 (n=5)</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women, Year 2 (n=5)</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Code co-occurrence table

\[ \text{Table: Accountability} \]


[2] Many studies have shown that change in organizations, community mobilization and accountability for the work of community mobilizers is critical. The work these mobilizers do requires a clear understanding of the dynamics of their relationship with the community.

[3] This analysis builds on previous work regarding accountability, highlighting the importance of understanding how accountability is negotiated within the community mobilizers' work.

[4] Accountability in the context of this study refers to the extent to which community mobilizers hold themselves and their organizations accountable for their actions.

[5] The key themes identified are Accountability, Group: Community Mobilizers.

[6] Illustrative Quotes:

- "I feel like we have a strong accountability in our group. We meet regularly to discuss our progress and ensure that we are following the guidelines set by the organization."

- "We are accountable for our actions, and we always try to ensure that we are meeting the needs of the community."

- "Accountability is crucial in our work. We always try to be transparent with the community and the organization."

Reflection notes:

1. How does the accountability framework developed be applicable in different contexts?
2. What are the implications of these findings for future research?
3. How can the principles of accountability be applied in practice to improve community mobilizer effectiveness?
RESULTS
ACCEPTABILITY OF VIOLENCE

• **Increased knowledge and awareness** about different types of violence (esp. about violence against children and emotional abuse)

• Reported knowing how to avoid being violent (e.g. conflict resolution) and how to respond if saw violence (e.g. call police)

• Some **ambivalence** about acceptability of violence
CHANGES IN VIOLENCE

- Reported changes in violence against children, negotiating sex, male-on-male violence, arguing and some intimate partner violence
- Most compelling narratives of change come from mobilizers
CHANGES IN VIOLENCE

• “I was unable to keep calm when I am angry. If I argue with my sister, I used to beat her. I used anything that I could to throw…to hit the person. At home I was harsh on children if I sent them to do something and they took a long time. I sometimes hit the child because I thought the person has disrespected me. Now there is a change because I don’t bother anyone…”

Male CAT member
Community Structures (e.g. religion, traditional leadership, etc.)

Dose/Role → Gender Norms → Reduced Violence

Shared Vocabulary

Accountability
GENDER NORMS

• “We made a mistake when we took women as half human, when we are not taking them as human beings like us.”

Male Mobilizer, Time 1
UNLEARNING VIOLENT BEHAVIOR

• *It is difficult to change... it is not an overnight thing ... You are not perfect. I’m not either.* I argued with my younger brother, and then I promised to beat him, you see. So, I feel like I violated him. And I was angry because I warned him many times to not do what he did, but he didn’t listen to me ... So it happened. (Male mobiliser, Time 2)

*Is this why we didn’t see expected outcomes in RCT? We weren’t specific or inclusive enough in our measures?
“After One Man Can taught us, we also took this message and spread it further – to tell other people and encourage them.”

Male Community Member Time 1

“There is no one who doesn’t know about One Man Can, even old people will tell you about it.”

Male Community Member Time 3
“For example, eeh… to negotiate sex it was not an easy thing. But now I am able to do it, I can able to negotiate sex and I don’t demand it….It doesn’t help anything when I tell people that sex needs to be negotiated and I don’t do it. Eeh… I must walk the talk. I have to live what I tell people…

Male Mobilizer Time 1

“People will say I’m making them fools because I don’t practice what I preach.”

Male Mobilizer Time 2
…Many people don’t believe that I do negotiate sex. I remember I was violent. **I beat my girlfriend.** I think I was 17 years old… And left her with a mark because I was demanding sex, you know. **Some are still reminding me about it even now...**

*Male Mobilizer Time 1*
“Previously I had to have three or four girlfriends at the same time. So since I joined OMC, I saw the risks of having multiple partners and also understand the pain that is there…when a person cheats on you….so I have changed there and had one girlfriend. The relationship failed and maybe she didn’t understand me because of the lifestyle I have now. So where it led me to be single again for one year and six months now…”

Male Mobilizer Time 2
COMMUNITY PUSH BACK

• “Because still there are men who don’t want to swallow the privileges that we were given by grannies and face truth, there are some men who believe that gender equality is for white people. It’s a western life not for black people. Though we are trying to engage them and there are some who are involved and see that it’s a good thing. But there are still some who thinks it humiliates them.”

Male Mobilizer, Time 1
DISCUSSION
LIMITATIONS

• Not a true baseline
• Social desirability bias
IMPLICATIONS

• Gender-transformative programming promising for reducing IPV and violence against children

• Community mobilization strategy bolstered message and support, but did not address all barriers

• Accountability a critical factor in maintaining behavior change

• For those with a history of violence, may need additional supports to unlearn behavior and reduce stressors
PARTNERSHIPS

MRC/Wits Rural Public Health and Health Transitions Research Unit
Wits Reproductive Health and HIV Institute
University of North Carolina Chapel Hill
University of California San Francisco
Sonke Gender Justice
FUNDING

• US National Institute of Mental Health: 1R01MH087118-01 (Pettifor) and 1R21MH090887-01 (Lippman).

• Wellcome Trust UK: 058893/Z/99/A; 069683/Z/02/Z; 085477/Z/08/Z; 085477/B/08/Z;

• UKaid from the Department of International Development (DfID) through the STRIVE Research Programme Consortium (Ref. Po 5244)

• Royster Society of Fellows, Injury & Violence Prevention Fellowship at UNC Chapel Hill Injury Prevention Research Center, and the Jamie Kimble Foundation for Courage


